Peer Review File

Article information: https://dx.doi.org/10.21037/aoj-23-6

Reviewer A:

Comment 1: The authors have thoroughly discussed the epidemiology, work up and treatment algorithms for recurrent shoulder instability in the setting of bone loss. I commend the authors on a well-organized manuscript. The outline of the manuscript flows in a logical order. The figures provide helpful visuals in understanding critical concepts that are described in the paper. In addition, the authors have clearly done a thorough literature review to include numerous recent articles on the related topics. This is a well written review article and will serve the readers of this journal with critical information and a better understanding of the decision making as it comes to recurrent both anterior and posterior shoulder instability.

Reply 1: The authors thank the reviewer for their comment.

Changes in the text: N/A

Reviewer B:

Comment 1: Introduction. Well written, detailed and validated with good review of supporting literature. A few sentences on multi directional instability maybe helpful for the reader to put into context that important issue as well.

Reply 1: The reviewer notes an important consideration in the evaluation and management of recurrent shoulder instability. A brief discussion of MDI has been added to the Introduction, as recommended.

Changes in the text: Lines 75-76, 91-93. Reference 10.

Comment 2: I would recommend also mentioning the GTIMS scoring system as i think it adds some useful information to the ISIS score

Di Giacomo G, Peebles LA, Pugliese M, Dekker TJ, Golijanin P, Sanchez A, Provencher MT. Glenoid Track Instability Management Score: Radiographic Modification of the Instability Severity Index Score. Arthroscopy. 2020 Jan;36(1):56-67. doi: 10.1016/j.arthro.2019.07.020. PMID: 31864596. as well the NISIS score for predicting failure of non-operative treatment maybe helpful as well.

Tokish JM, Thigpen CA, Kissenberth MJ, Tolan SJ, Lonergan KT, Tokish JM Jr, Dickens JF, Hawkins RJ, Shanley E. The Nonoperative Instability Severity Index Score (NISIS): A Simple Tool to Guide Operative Versus Nonoperative Treatment of the Unstable Shoulder. Sports Health. 2020 Nov/Dec;12(6):598-602. doi: 10.1177/1941738120925738. Epub 2020 Jul 1. PMID: 32609577; PMCID: PMC7785891.

Reply 2: The reviewer highlights several important scoring systems that are useful in the workup of patients with glenohumeral instability, as well as with surgical planning. A short discussion of the GTIMS has been included, as well as brief mention of the NISIS. Changes in the text: Lines 358-365. References 70, 71.

Comment 3: Imaging - good review

Treatment - good algorithm - may want to touch on the location of the HS and its impact to the track / engaging non-engaging and management

Reply 3: The authors thank the reviewer for this comment. A brief discussion of the location/morphology of the Hill Sachs lesion, and its implications for treatment, has been added to the imaging as well as treatment sections.

Changes in the text: Lines 286-289, 391-393. Reference 57.