Peer Review File

Article information: https://dx.doi.org/10.21037/aoj-23-7

Major revision
Comment 1: I would consider removing the word "evidence-based" from describing your algorithm. In your narrative, you do not describe how your algorithm was developed. You also fail to provide an evidence grading for the literature that you use to develop your algorithm. The readers are unaware of which methodology you used to create this algorithm or if it was solely developed by the authors as a result of reading the literature. You also fail to provide details of your literature search.
Reply 1: We have resolved this and used different verbiage. As this paper was neither a meta-analysis nor systematic review, we performed a detailed literature review in order to create the algorithm.
Changes in the text: See abstract.

Comment 2: There are several recent randomized controlled trials, meta-analyses, and network meta-analyses that should warrant discussion in your manuscript. Data from these would serve to update your outcomes and add to the validity of your recommendations. Here are some to name a few.

Maillot, Cédric MD, MSc,†; Martellotto, Alice MD‡; Demezon, Hugues MD*; Harly, Edouard MD*; Le Huec, Jean-Charles MD, PhD*,§. Multiple Treatment Comparisons for Large and Massive Rotator Cuff Tears: A Network Meta-analysis. Clinical Journal of Sport Medicine 31(6):p 501-508, November 2021. | DOI: 10.1097/JSM.0000000000000786*

Imam M, Sallam A, Ernstbrunner L, Boyce G, Bardakos N, Abdelkafy A, Moussa M, Ghazal MA. Three-year functional outcome of transosseous-equivalent double-row vs. single-row repair of small and large rotator cuff tears: a double-blinded randomized controlled trial. J Shoulder Elbow Surg. 2020 Oct;29(10):2015-2026. doi: 10.1016/j.jse.2020.05.005. Epub 2020 Jun 9. PMID: 32951642.

Maillot C, Martellotto A, Demezon H, Harly E, Le Huec JC. Multiple Treatment Comparisons for Large and Massive Rotator Cuff Tears: A Network Meta-analysis. Clin J Sport Med. 2021 Nov 1;31(6):501-508. doi: 10.1097/JSM.0000000000000786. PMID: 31743220.

Lapner P, Henry P, Athwal GS, Moktar J, McNeil D, MacDonald P; Canadian Shoulder and Elbow Society. Treatment of rotator cuff tears: a systematic review and meta-analysis. J Shoulder Elbow Surg. 2022 Mar;31(3):e120-e129. doi: 10.1016/j.jse.2021.11.002. Epub 2021 Dec 11. PMID: 34906681.

Sevivas N, Ferreira N, Andrade R, Moreira P, Portugal R, Alves D, Vieira da Silva M, Sousa N, Salgado AJ, Espregueira-Mendes J. Reverse shoulder arthroplasty for irreparable massive rotator cuff tears: a systematic review with meta-analysis and meta-regression. J Shoulder Elbow Surg. 2017 Sep;26(9):e265-e277. doi: 10.1016/j.jse.2017.03.039. Epub 2017 Jul 3. PMID: 28684233.

Kovacevic D, Suriani RJ Jr, Grawe BM, Yian EH, Gilotra MN, Hasan SA, Srikumaran U, Hasan SS, Cuomo F, Burks RT, Green AG, Nottage WM, Theja S, Kassam HF, Saad MA, Ramirez MA, Stanley RJ, Williams MD, Nadarajah V, Konja AC, Koh JL, Rokito AS, Jobin CM, Levine WN, Schmidt CC; American Shoulder and Elbow Surgeons Massive Cuff Evaluation and Research Initiative (ASES MERIT) Investigators. Management of irreparable massive rotator cuff tears: a systematic review and meta-analysis of patient-reported outcomes, reoperation rates, and treatment response. J Shoulder Elbow Surg. 2020 Dec;29(12):2459-2475. doi: 10.1016/j.jse.2020.07.030. Epub 2020 Aug 4. PMID: 32763381; PMCID: PMC7669555.

Reply 2: We have included the studies mentioned.
Changes in the text: Page 2, Lines 76-79; Page 5, Lines 200-201; Page 3, Lines 138 – 142; Page 3, Lines 115 – 118, Lines 127 – 128; Page 5, Lines 238 – 239; Page 6, Lines 289 – 293

Minor revision:
Comment 1: Sentence 3 in your abstract does not make sense: "rotator cuff tears a..."
Reply 1: This sentence has been made into 2 sentences.
Changes in the text: See Lines 10-11

Comment 2: You interchange "massive rotator cuff tears" with "massive cuff tears " with "massive tears". To improve reader clarity, it might be best to be consistent.
Reply 2: We have abbreviated massive rotator cuff tears with ‘MRCT’ and corrected all inconsistencies with either the full or abbreviated term.

Comment 3: You have grammatical errors in your algorithm (i.e. funciton)
Reply 3: We have addressed this error in the algorithm
Changes in the text: See Figure